Differentiating “True” and “Stylized” Romantic Fragments: A Schenkerian Approach
Aaron Grant, Eastman School of Music

In his discussion of Chopin’s Prelude in G major, Carl Schachter characterized Schumann’s fragments as “true fragments,” while describing Chopin’s pieces as “stylized fragments,” stating that “even the shortest of the Chopin Preludes makes sense when played alone” (1999, 58). Although work by Rosen (1980/1995), Daverio (1987/1993/1997), Marvin (2005), Sobaskie (2007), Kaminsky (1989/1990), Perry (2005), and Perrey (2002) has expanded our understanding of these two composers’ approaches to the romantic fragment, the analytical and theoretical implications of Schachter’s observation remain unexplored.

This study addresses this concern, using Schenkerian theory to examine the two composers’ fragmentary works, bringing to light an array of background and foreground elements that distinguish Schumann’s “true” from Chopin’s “stylized” fragments. For instance, Schumann’s fragments often project incomplete Urlinien, while Chopin’s fragments almost always convey complete tonal structures. While previous scholarship has acknowledged that romantic fragments may project either complete or incomplete Urlinien, the various technical means by which composers elaborate these tonal structures and the ramifications of these compositional decisions remain insufficiently understood.

The first section of this paper offers a summary of Schenkerian mechanisms for explaining tonally and formally incomplete works. Part two presents analyses of selected works from Schumann’s early piano cycles and Chopin’s preludes that elucidate the differences in these repertoires. Through these analyses, this section shows how a piece’s voice leading provides the distinction between “true” and “stylized” fragments. Finally, part three considers how this distinction can be applied to other repertoires, including fragments by Schubert and Liszt.

Aesthetics and Hermeneutics in Schubert’s Expanded Birotational Sonatas
Jonathan Guez (Yale University)

Schubert had a life-long interest in birotational sonata forms. He composed these Overture-like, or Baroque-binary like, pieces from his very first essays until his very last. In this presentation I claim
that it is possible to articulate a set of features that characterize Schubert’s individualized appropriation of the birotational sonata, and I provide historical and analytical evidence to buttress that claim. First, I isolate what Sonata Theory calls the Expanded Type 1 sonata, which Schubert returned to very often in finales of his late chamber music—and use it as a lens through which to view issues of sonata praxis, within his oeuvre and in larger historical contexts. Second, I analyze four pieces for which Schubert chose this idiosyncratic form—the finales of DD. 804, 956, and 960 and the Overture _im italienischen Stil_ D. 590. My analyses suggest that Schubert’s deployment of the form is predicated on an aesthetics of symmetry. In each case, after adding a developmental interpolation which distorts the symmetry of the birotational form, the pieces “compensate” for their enlargements by deleting a set of referential modules. In each case some existing continuity (registral, thematic, voice-leading) is preserved, or a new one is revealed. These compensations, which work in service of a broad symmetry of halves, allow us to conceive of symmetry in terms of a quest narrative—a sophisticated method of processual play. The remainder of the presentation fleshes out historical and narrative interpretations of this Schubertian behavior.

---

**Pierre Boulez and the Myth of Serial Organicism**  
Joseph Salem (Yale University)

Recent scholarship on Pierre Boulez has emphasized the rigorous, thoroughly serial nature of the composer’s music during the 1950s and the corresponding shift toward more transparent compositional techniques in later works due to Boulez’s increasing interest in musical perception. My paper nuance this perspective by arguing that practical compositional concerns (commissions, deadlines, and the like) led Boulez to reuse compositional material in ways that contradicted his early serial aesthetics while also expanding the expressive range of his compositional style—all well before his post-1970s writings and compositions.

I focus on the discrepancies between a single compositional technique – the generation of _blocs sonores_ (or “stacks”) – and how this technique was adapted for use in a number of different musical works. From their introduction in _Oubli signal lapidé_ (1952) and _Marteau sans maître_ (1955) to their radical reimagining in _Improvisation III_ (1959, r. 1983) and _Structures 2_ (1956–61), stacks are used to convert twelve-tone rows into vertical conglomerates of pitch material that can be redistributed as melodic or harmonic music; what changes over time is how Boulez derives these structures from his original rows, as well as how chromatically saturated each stack sequence is. Changes to this essential compositional process reveal Boulez’s shifting priorities as a serial composer well before the publication of _Boulez on Music Today_, such as his changing conception of structural coherence and musical organicism.

---

**Play This, Hear That: Three Contrasting Approaches to Modularity in Contemporary Music**  
Christopher Gainey (University of British Columbia)

Modular analysis allows for effective comparisons to be made between works across a broad stylistic range by isolating discrete patterns within each work and formulating relatively precise descriptions of the roles of these patterns as functional components, or modules, of a larger formal structure. This type of analysis leads to the formation of narratives of compositional process that feature a high degree of descriptive precision while remaining neutral with regard to considerations of style. Without overt references to the contrasts between particular schools of compositional technique,
modular analyses provide a useful foundation for a discussion of relationships between what is written, what is played, and what is heard. In this paper, I apply a modular analytical approach to Figment No. 2: Remembering Mr. Ives by Elliott Carter, the second of Thomas Adès Mazurkas Op. 27, and "Papillon II" from Kaija Saariaho's Sept Papillons and suggest ways in which an awareness of modular design may enrich the experience of listening to or performing this music.

**The Fonte Schema and Dispositio: Paradigms for Analysis**
Simon Prosser (CUNY Graduate Center)

Recent scholarship applying schema theory to eighteenth-century music has revealed a rich vocabulary of schemata underlying its composition, improvisation, and pedagogy. But as Michael Callahan points out, much of this scholarship “does not say enough about the crucial element of improvisational [or compositional] choice among several [schemata] that could all accomplish a similar task.”

Re-interpreting Callahan’s concept of dispositio—“the large-scale formal trajectories” that an eighteenth-century composer or improvisor would have had at their disposal—as middleground-voice-leading paradigms, I shall demonstrate some of the standard eighteenth-century procedures involving the Fonte schema. I shall show how the Fonte is typically used in a composition—what specific compositional tasks it fulfills and how—and what characteristics of the schema make it suitable to these tasks.

This work has the potential to help flesh-out our understanding of the role that schemata played in eighteenth-century music by showing more precisely how specific schemata were used in composition and improvisation. It can also help make voice-leading analysis of eighteenth-century music more responsive to schemata and other lower-level patterns, and integrating them into larger structures. Finally, these paradigms could be used to enhance the pedagogy of Schenkerian analysis.

**Climax Archetype and its Variants in Verismo Operas**
Ji Yeon Lee (CUNY Graduate Center)

The term “verismo” in opera is generally—and inaccurately—understood to mean “realism.” Andreas Giger more aptly reframes verismo as the breaking down of convention in musical harmony and form, lyrical prosody, dramaturgy, and production, with an emphasis on the faithful conveyance of psychological narrative. Compositionally, this approach ushered in the dissolution of the so-called conventional form (*la solita forma*), which had required set pieces to be cast in strict, multi-movement forms demarcated by cadential punctuation. While the dissolution of this form contributes a dynamic sense of drive and mobility that defines verismo opera, the psychological experience of this dynamism has not yet been theorized or analyzed. The present paper addresses this need by developing a climax archetype (consists of initiation, intensification, highpoint, and abatement) as a methodological framework for analyses of excerpts from Giordano’s Andrea Chenier (1896), Zandonai’s Francesca da Rimini (1914), and Puccini’s Il tabarro (1916).

Through the climax theory, the present paper bridges the psychological, subjective aspect of the listening experience with a systematic investigation of the musical devices creating that experience. By emphasizing the importance of climax structures as an essential element of verismo style, this
approach contributes to a recalibration of verismo via musical language instead of the thoroughly investigated social and historical context.

**Modern Music Theory: Realism and Technicity**  
Jairo Moreno (University of Pennsylvania)

As contemporary music theory vibrantly disperses across an ever-widening constellation of models (Schenker, neo-Riemannian and transformational theory, corpora studies, cognition, Sonata-form theory, among others), the history of theory seems for the most part to have reached a state of relative stagnation. The excitement that accompanied the field’s turn-of-the-century rapprochement to post-structuralism has waned, and the central historical question of the task of theory-as-representation has been summarily dismissed as a belated effect of the linguistic turn in our field. According to Veit Erlmann, modern theory’s concern with representation masked no less than an attempt by rationalists of all kinds to suppress music’s inherent resonance. To redress this imbalance, a different history emerges: not of music, but of hearing. With this auditory turn, theory seems further relegated to the margins of intellectual history, and the history of science gains central command of that history.

Against this backdrop, I argue for a reconsideration of a history of music theory that attends to a) its material dimension and b) its technical character. Focusing on developments during 18th-century France and the work of Jean-Philippe Rameau and Denis Diderot, I rethink the wagers made on the figures of the corps sonore and l’homme clavecin as means to mediate tensions intrinsic to musical objects’ essential and sensual qualities, as proposed recently by philosopher Graham Harman. Against Erlmann’s argument on behalf of a physicalist history of 18th-century hearing, I counter with a realist account of musical objects. In this account 18th-century French music theory emerges not as a failed science but as an episode in the long history of mediation in which music theory’s technicity (techniques as human action, technologies as non-human factors, and technics as the historical disposition to techniques and technologies) blurs the distinction between reason and resonance that it presumably helped produce.

**Formal Functions and Terminally Climactic Forms in the Music of System Of A Down**  
Dakota Killpack (Princeton University)

The idea of terminally climactic forms (henceforth TCFs), advanced by Brad Osborn in his 2013 article, “Subverting the Verse-Chorus Paradigm: Terminally Climactic Structures in Recent Rock Music,” illustrates a new way of creating formal structure in postmillennial rock: no longer subscribing to models of verse/chorus alternation, with the dramatic highpoint created through a final return of chorus material, songs with TCFs aim towards a climax in a sustained section of novel material at the end of a song. The music of System Of A Down (henceforth SOAD), an Armenian-American alternative metal band, through a combination of Armenian elements and characteristics of the harmonic language endemic to metal, creates song-final sections that fulfill the form-function requirements for a TCF without the need for novel material. This paper advances the theoretical construct of a rotator, a special type of circular harmonic progression that is capable of sufficient form-functional autonomy to create a terminal climax through the transformation of recapitulated material alone. Support from psychological studies by Justin London and Jay Juchniewicz is given, shedding light on the perceptual elements that underlie the creation of formal functions.
Improvisation, Interaction, and Interpretation: Relational Dynamics in Duke Ellington’s “Money Jungle”
Garrett Michaelsen (University of Massachusetts, Lowell)

In this paper, I present an extension of Garrett Michaelsen’s theory of musical interaction in jazz improvisation that incorporates an understanding of “relational dynamics.” Central to Michaelsen’s theory are processes of convergence and divergence, which are the principal means by which he understands musicians’ utterances as coming together or growing apart. By adding a continuum of positive and negative relational valence to this spectrum of convergence and divergence, I enable a constellation of new interpretive meanings. I will then present an interpretation of the musical interaction found in Duke Ellington’s “Money Jungle” that takes into account the unique circumstances surrounding the recording of his 1962 album of the same name. Two much younger musicians, Charles Mingus and Max Roach, joined Ellington on this date, and constantly pushed and pulled against the older jazz statesman. Due to their complicated interpersonal history, Mingus in particular presented numerous challenges to Ellington that resulted in him walking out of the recording session. Ellington eventually coaxed Mingus back in to finish, a fact that provides an apt metaphor for the musical interaction found in their performance of “Money Jungle.” While Mingus tends towards divergence throughout the performance, Ellington and Roach do their best to support and incorporate Mingus’s utterances into the ongoing flow of the improvisation.

Between Repetition and Contrast: Thematic Structure in Filmic Main Title Themes
Mark Richards (University of Lethbridge)

A great many main title themes in film music appear to adopt the familiar classical structures of the sentence and period, as defined by William Caplin (1998). Although these theme types both begin with a short unit called a basic idea, their second idea marks a crucial difference: the sentence restates the basic idea while the period proceeds to a contrasting idea. In the classical repertoire, the distinction between these two units is generally made exceedingly clear, but in filmic themes, a predominant structural principle involves the variation of ideas rather their repetition or contrast. Hence, a theme’s second idea typically encompasses both similarity and difference, conflating a key distinction between the classical sentence and period. In this paper, I therefore submit that filmic themes are more successfully identified by comparing their concomitant halves: after a first half containing an initial idea and its variation, a sentence moves into an acceleration whereas a period returns to the opening idea. This broader perspective also allows for the recognition of another common theme type in film in which an idea is stated four times successively with variation, a structure I call a clause. While these three theme types all begin with an idea and its variation, each continues in quite a different manner in its second half, and it is this second half that defines the type of theme. This paper will demonstrate the value and importance of such an adapted Caplinian methodology when applied to filmic main title themes.
Key Profiles in Bruckner’s Symphonic Expositions: “Ein Potpourri von Exaltationen”?  
Nathan Pell (The New School)

After 100 years, Bruckner’s music is finally receiving more than a grudging acceptance into the concert hall and analytic canon. But because of their novel harmonic and formal tendencies, his symphonies are often subjected to extravagant analytical practices reflecting their fringe tonality. Schenker, himself a Bruckner student, viewed them as sublime, but ultimately unworkable, harmonic jumbles: “a potpourri of exaltations.” But, the few extant Schenkerian studies of Bruckner seem to stretch the analytic method too far. This paper argues that Bruckner’s music should be viewed as more deeply rooted in the tonal tradition and can be analyzed using more orthodox applications of Schenkerian principles.

I focus on Bruckner’s use of sonata form, particularly the key structure of his expositions. Darcy has argued that most of Bruckner’s second themes are presented in the “wrong” key, creating a nontraditional “suspension field…[isolated] from the main line of the default symphonic discourse.” Taking this view as a point of departure, I will show (1) that Bruckner’s second theme key choices do not break from tradition—they have precedent in earlier, more canonic literature; and (2) that distinct “profiles” emerge from them: Bruckner uses I-to-V in opening movements, I-to-III-to-V in finales. These profiles suggest both that Bruckner conceived of deep structure as chromatically saturated, and that he varied the degree of saturation to differentiate one type of movement from another. Thus, Bruckner’s chromatic second themes—far from “suspending” a movement’s trajectory—represent powerful events en route to the dominant that energize his finale expositions

Modal Mixture as a Dynamic Process in Two Brahms Songs  
Loretta Terrigno (CUNY Graduate Center)

Schenkerian studies of Brahms’ and Schubert’s Lieder have often used the achievement of the Kopfton as a metaphor for dramatic events, particularly the arrival of a climactic moment or turning point, in the poetry (Schenker, 1979; Platt, 1994). As demonstrated by David Lewin, this moment can have an effect on the perception of a song’s mode; major and minor forms of the tonic E vie for supremacy in his analysis of Schubert’s Auf dem Flusse, which posits a “secret E-major deep structure” that “lies unter der Rinde of the E-minor surface structure.” (Lewin, 1982). Lewin’s hierarchical metaphor represents the protagonist’s numbness (E minor) and the hot, passionate feeling that lies beneath it (E major). Building upon Lewin’s dramatically sensitive reading of Schubert, meaning can be ascribed to structural events linked to mode mixture in two Brahms songs: Es träumte mir (Op. 57 no. 3), which uses the opposition between natural and altered forms of 3 to express a dichotomy between reality and dreaming; and Nachtigall (Op. 97 no. 1), which portrays unattainable, long-lost tones in the poem by withholding a definitive cadence in the major mode (and the achievement of 3) until the song’s final measures. Yet, rather than illustrating mixture through a dramatic rise to the Kopfton arrival, both Lieder enact a dynamic process of achieving and sustaining the major mode through the agents of piano and vocal personae—constructs originally identified by Edward T. Cone—on the Lied’s surface.